

**Department of Anthropology  
University of Pittsburgh**

*Anthropology 1750: UGS: Violence, Tolerance and Dominance  
at Shared Religious Sites.*

Professor Robert M. Hayden  
rhayden@pitt.edu

Spring Term 2010

Course Description:

This course analyzes “antagonistic tolerance,” or contested sharing of religious sites. Worldwide, and widely throughout history, sacred sites have been shared, and sometimes contested, by members of different religious communities. Long periods of peaceful interaction and even religious syncretism may be punctuated by periods of violence, and the physical transformation of the shared sites. This course examines this dynamic by looking at case studies drawn from Europe (Bulgaria, Portugal, Turkey), Asia (India) and Latin America (Mexico, the Inka Empire). The approach draws on both cultural anthropology and archeology, and some of the case studies are based on recent ethnography, others on ethnohistorical data, others still on archeological data. The cases have been developed in the course of a large-scale comparative research project by the instructor and an international team of scholars, and the course will work through their initial efforts at drawing conclusions from this ongoing project. The course will thus be an introduction to an ongoing, complex project in anthropology, including both archeology and cultural anthropology. Students will be encouraged to think about how the general model might be applicable in other world regions.

Readings:

This course does not presume that students know much, if indeed anything, about most, even any, of the cases to be studied. Some readings are given as background (e.g. Mazower’s short history of the Balkans). Lectures will provide necessary background, but also presume that you have read the assigned materials. Thus, *you should read the assignments **before** coming to class!* My classes are highly participatory, and if you have not done the reading you will not know what is going on. There are “breathing spaces” in the syllabus to let you catch up on/ assimilate the readings.

If the reading is from a journal and the article is available electronically through the PittCat system, it is your responsibility to access it, download it and print it if you want. Materials not so available will be posted to Courseweb.

I won’t assign much of it, but anyone who loves reading might try William Dalrymple’s brilliant, and wonderfully written, scholarly/ adventure (!?) travelogue *From the Holy Mountain: A Journey in the Shadow of Byzantium*, which recounts the author’s travels through the remnants of the Byzantine Empire in Turkey,

Syria, Lebanon and Israel, in 1994. Dalrymple visited many, many sites appropriate for this course.

Requirements and Grades: There will be a midterm examination (25%), a final exam (25%), and a seminar paper (40%), the latter due at the end of the term, but preceded by a presentation in the last class sessions. Since this is a new area of research, class attendance and participation are very important, and count for 10%. See below on the paper and the presentation.

*Note:* Though there are both graduate and undergraduate students in this course, they are evaluated on different scales—undergrads are not expected to perform at the same level as graduate students, though I will be very pleased if any do so.

Seminar Format & Presentations: A seminar, by definition, is highly interactive, and I encourage participation in discussion. Further, each participant will make a research-based presentation on the topic of his/ her term paper – see next section. For undergraduate students, these presentations will come at the end of the term. Grad students, who should ahead of the game anyway, will present earlier.

Term paper: The term paper and associated presentation will be the most important products of this course. Each student must write a paper on a topic closely related to the subject matter of this course, and approved by me. The paper must be on a case of “antagonistic tolerance,” or competition over/ sharing of a religious site. Which site is up to each student, provided s/he can gain access to sufficient literature. Obvious choices of topics would include the Great Cathedral of Cordoba (which contains the Great mosque of Cordoba), other sites in Iberia (e.g. Jerez, Spain, or Evora, Portugal), many sites in Jerusalem, Hagia Sofia in Istanbul. But there are many, many others: e.g., there is a really good book about competitive sharing of churches between Catholics and Protestants in central Europe in the 17<sup>th</sup> Century; and another about the transition from Egyptian religion to Roman Christianity. The choice is up to you, *provided* it is cleared with me.

## CLASS TOPICS AND READINGS

- Jan. 6: Introduction
- Jan. 11: The “Antagonistic Tolerance” model  
 Robert Hayden, “Antagonistic Tolerance,” *Current Anthropology* 41(2): 205-231 (2002)  
 NSF proposal  
*Recommended:* John Locke, *A Letter Concerning Toleration* (available in on-line editions)
- Jan. 13: Politics of cultural independence  
 Readings: begin Mazower, *Short History of the Balkans*  
*Graduate students:* Maria Todorova, *Imagining the Balkans*, London: Oxford U.P. 1997.  
 Guest speaker: Prof. Klaus Roth, University of Munich
- Jan. 18: NO CLASS – M.L.King Day
- Jan. 20: Indicators of dominance  
*Grad students:* Jas Elner, “Iconoclasm & the Preservation of Memory,” pp. 209-231 in Robert Nelson & Margaret Olin, eds, *Monuments & Memory, Made & Unmade*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003.
- Jan. 25: The Balkans, 1:  
 Turkey: Haci Augustus, Ankara  
 Finish Mazower, *Short History of the Balkans*  
*Graduate students:* Ebrus Boyar, *Ottomans, Turks & the Balkans: Empire Lost Relations Altered*. London: Taurus Academic Studies, 2007.
- Jan 27: The Balkans, 2  
 Turkey: the Byzantine Mosque at Tirilye  
 Readings: F. W. Hasluck, *Christianity & Islam Under the Sultans* vol 1: “Transference of Urban Sanctuaries” and “Transference of Rural Sanctuaries” [*note: this book is available in electronic form via Pittcat*]  
 Rossitsa Gradeva, “Ottoman Policy towards Christian Church Buildings,” *Balkan Studies (Etudes Balkaniques)* 1994: 14-36.
- Feb 1: Turkey: sacred museums: Hacibektas, Sayitgazi  
 Robert Nelson, “Tourists, Terrorists & Metaphysical Theater at Hagia Sophia,” pp. 59-81 in Robert Nelson & Margaret Olin, eds,

*Monuments & Memory, Made & Unmade*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003.

Presenter: Rabia Harmanshah

- Feb. 3: Macedonia  
 Film: "Peace for All" (Мир на сите), Elizabeth Koneska  
 Readings: Elizabeta Koneska, "Shared Shrines in Macedonia," in E. Koneska & R. Jankuloski, *Shared Shrines*. Skopje: Macedonian Centre for Photography, 2009.  
 Glenn Bowman, "Hasluck Redux: Contemporary Sharing of Shrines in Macedonia." Ms.
- Feb 8, 10: SNOW DAYS – no class
- Feb. 15: Serbia:  
 Readings: Hayden "Religious Structures and Political Dominance in Belgrade." *Anthropologia Balkanica* 9: 213-222 (2005).
- Feb 17: Greece:  
 Heath W. Lowry, "Shared Sanctuaries" and "Invented and/or Reclaimed Sanctuaries," pp. 32-60 in Lowry, *In the Footsteps of the Ottomans: A Search for Sacred Spaces & Architectural Monuments in Northern Greece*. Istanbul: Bahcesehir University Press, 2009  
 Charles Stewart, "Immanent or Eminent Domain? The Contest over Thessaloniki's Rotonda," pp. 182-198 in Robert Layton, Peter Stone & Julian Thomas, eds, *Destruction & Conservation of Cultural Property*. London: Routledge, 2001.
- Feb 22: Bulgaria: Sofia; Akyazul Baba, Bali Efendi  
 Readings: Kmetova, Tatjana and Lubomir Mikov (1998) "Bali Efendi of Sofia – a 16<sup>th</sup> Century Moslem Saint." *Ethnologia Bulgarica. Yearbook of Bulgarian Ethnology and Folklore* 1 (1998): 78-92
- Feb. 24: Iberia: Introduction  
 John Edwards, "The Changing Use of Worship in Roman & Medieval Cordoba," pp. 221-235 in Robert Layton, Peter Stone & Julian Thomas, eds, *Destruction & Conservation of Cultural Property*. London: Routledge, 2001.  
 Jose Saramago, *History of the Siege of Lisbon* 9-21, 59-65  
**Student paper topics due**
- Mar 1: Portugal: Mertola; "paleochristians"  
 Steffan Dix, "Roman Catholicism & Religious Pluralities in Portuguese (Iberian) History," *Journal of Religion in Europe* 1 (1): 60-84 (2008)

*Graduate students:* "Introduction," pp. 1-26 in Christopher MacEvitt, *The Crusades & the Christian World of the East*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008

Mar. 3: First Exam

**Mar. 8, 10: NO CLASS – Spring Break**

Mar. 15: formerly Portuguese India: Goa  
Antonio de Noronha, *The Hindus of Goa & the Portuguese Republic* (translation by Ave Cleto Afonso, Goa: Broadway Book Centre, 2008), pp. 7-69 [*note:* this is a bilingual edition, so unless you read Portuguese, you'll read only the odd-numbered pages!]

Mar. 17: India: Ayodhya  
S. Ratnagar, Archaeology at the Heart of a Political Confrontation: The Case of Ayodhya. *Current Anthropology* 45 (2): 239-259 (2004)  
Sushil Shrivastava, "The Disputed Mosque," *Frontier* (Calcutta), Jan. 26, 1991.  
*Recommended:* Richard Eaton, "Temple Desecration and Indo-Muslim States," *Journal of Islamic Studies* 11(3): 283-319 (2000)  
*Graduate Students:* Satish Deshpande, "Hegemonic Spatial Strategies: The Nation-Space and Hindu Communalism in Twentieth-Century India," *Public Culture* 10(2): 249-283 (1998)

Mar. 22: Christians in Palestine: Israel/ West Bank  
Readings: "Identification & identity formations around shared shrines in West Bank Palestine and Western Macedonia," in D. Albera & M. Couroucli, eds, *Lieux Saints en partage: Explorations anthropologiques dans l'espace mediterraneen*. Arles: Actes Sud, 2009  
William Dalrymple, *From the Holy Mountain*, pp. 326-372  
**Paper outlines due**

Mar. 24: Inka Peru – Enrique Lopez-Hurtado  
"Introduction," pp. 1-9 in Conrad, Geoffrey W. and Arthur A. Demarest, *Religion and Empire: The Dynamics of Aztec and Inca Expansionism*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1984.  
Bauer, Brian S. and Charles Stanish, "Inca Shrine Worship in the Andes." Ch. 1 in *Ritual and Pilgrimage in the Ancient Andes: The Islands of the Sun and the Moon*. University of Texas Press, Austin, 2001.  
Patterson, Thomas C, "Pachacamac: An Andean Oracle under Inca Rule." In *Papers from the Second Annual Northeast Conference on Andean Archaeology and Ethnohistory*, edited by P. Kvietok and D.

H. Sandweiss, pp. 159-76. Latin American Studies Program, Cornell University, Ithaca, 1985.

- Mar. 29: Post-colonial Peru: Enrique Lopez- Hurtado  
Enrique López-Hurtado and Jason Nesbitt, "Provincial Religious Centers in the Inka Empire: Propagators of Official Ideology or Spaces for Local Resistance?" In *Comparative Perspectives on the Archaeology of Coastal South America*, edited by Robyn E. Cutright, Enrique López-Hurtado, and Alexander Martin. University of Pittsburgh Center for Comparative Archaeology, Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, Pittsburgh, Lima, 2010.
- Mar. 31: Mexico  
Manuel Aguilar-Moreno, Lesley Negrete nad Robert Hayden, "The Mexica-Aztec: Foreign Deities & Sacred Spaces." Ms. Bauer & Stanish, Aztec Imperial Expansion.  
*Recommended:* Hamman, "Chronological Pollution: Potsherds, Mosques, and Broken Gods before and after the Conquest of Mexico." *Current Anthropology* 49 (5): 803-836 (2008)
- April 5: Critiques of the AT model:  
Glenn Bowman, "Orthodox – Muslim Interactions at 'Mixed Shrines' in Macedonia," in Chris Hann & Hermann Goltz, eds, *Eastern Christians: An Anthropological Perspective*. Berkeley: U. Cal Press 2009  
Dionigi Albera, "'Why Are You Mixing what Cannot be Mixed?' Shared Devotions in the Monotheisms." *History & Anthropology* 19(1): 37-59 (2008).
- April 7: Politics and "Heritage"  
P. Kohl, M. Kozelsky and N. Ben-Yehuda, "Selective Remembrances: Archaeology in the Construction, Commemoration & Consecration of National Pasts," pp. 1-28 in P. Kohl, M. Kozelsky and N. Ben-Yehuda, eds., *Selective Remembrances: Archaeology in the Construction, Commemoration & Consecration of National Pasts*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007.  
Hassner, "To Halve and to Hold: The Politics of Sacred Space and the Problem of Indivisibility," *Security Studies* 12(4): 1-33 (2003)
- April 12: *Student Presentations*
- April 14: *Student presentations; FINAL PAPERS DUE*
- April 19: *Student presentations;*
- April 21: Second exam