THOUGHT EXPERIMENTS
IN
SCIENCE AND PHILOSOPHY
CPS PUBLICATIONS IN PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Edited on behalf of the
Center for Philosophy of Science
University of Pittsburgh

by

Gerald Massey
James E. McGuire
Nicholas Rescher
Merilee Salmon
Kenneth Schaffner
Wilfred Sellars
THOUGHT EXPERIMENTS IN SCIENCE AND PHILOSOPHY

Edited by Tamara Horowitz and Gerald J. Massey

PREFACE

This volume originated in a conference on "The Place of Thought Experiments in Science and Philosophy" which was organized by us and held at the Center for Philosophy of Science at the University of Pittsburgh, April 18-20, 1986. The idea behind this conference was to encourage philosophers and scientists to talk to each other about the role of thought experiments in their various disciplines.

These papers were either written for the conference, or were written after it by commentators and other participants. We are grateful to those who committed themselves, before the conference, to presenting as yet unwritten papers, and to those who wrote papers for this volume after the conference was over. We hope that this volume will be of use to other philosophers and scientists who are interested in thought experiments, as well as inspire more work in this area.

There are many people who were helpful both in organizing the conference and preparing the volume. We particularly thank our colleague Nicholas Rescher, then Director of the Center and now its Vice Chairman, both for his initial support which made it possible for us to have the conference, as well as his invaluable help in shepherding this volume through the press. Barbara Massey helped with the introduction, Linda Butera with the assistance of Deborah Layne insured that the conference ran smoothly, and Mary Connor helped bring this volume together. David Carey, Susan Sterrett, and Martha Harty-Scheiner all provided editorial assistance. Finally, we would like to express our appreciation to the R.K. Mellon Foundation for financial support of the conference as well as of this volume.

Tamara Horowitz & Gerald J. Massey

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

January 1991
THOUGHT EXPERIMENTS IN SCIENCE AND PHILOSOPHY

CONTENTS

Preface .................................................................................................................. 1
Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1

SECTION 1 – THOUGHT EXPERIMENTS IN
THE HISTORY OF SCIENCE AND PHILOSOPHY

1. Nicholas Rescher: Thought Experimentation in
Presocratic Philosophy ..................................................................................... 31
2. Peter King: Mediaeval Thought-Experiments:
The Metamethodology of Mediaeval Science ..................................................... 43
3. Lilli Alanen: Descartes, Conceivability, and
Logical Modality .................................................................................................. 65

SECTION 2 – THOUGHT EXPERIMENTS IN
LOGIC AND MATHEMATICS

4. D. A. Anapolitanos: Thought Experiments and
Conceivability Conditions .................................................................................. 87
5. Barbara D. Massey: Do All Rational Folk Reason As We Do?
Frege's Thought Experiment Reconsidered ....................................................... 99

SECTION 3 – THOUGHT EXPERIMENTS IN THE SCIENCES

6. Allen I. Janis: Can Thought Experiments Fail? .............................................. 113
7. James Robert Brown: Thought Experiments:
A Platonic Account ............................................................................................. 119
9. Andrew D. Irvine: On the Nature of Thought Experiments
in Scientific Reasoning ......................................................................................... 149
10. Ronald Laymon: Thought Experiments of Stevin Mach and
Gouy: Thought Experiments as Ideal Limits and as
Semantic Domains ............................................................................................... 167
11. Mark Wilson: Reflections on Strings ............................................................ 193
12. John Forge: Thought Experiments in the Philosophy
of Physical Science ................................................................................................ 209
13. James G. Lennox: Darwinian Thought Experiments:
A Function for Just-So Stories ........................................................................... 223
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 4 – Thought Experiments in Philosophy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15. J. N. Mohanty: Method of Imaginative Variation in Phenomenology ........................................ 261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Rolf George: The Tradition of Thought Experiments in Epistemology ...................................... 273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Gerald Massey: Backdoor Analyticity ............................................................................................ 285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Richard M. Gale: On Some Pernicious Thought-Experiments ...................................................... 297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Tamara Horowitz: Newcomb's Problem as a Thought Experiment ................................................. 305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Stephen Cade Hetherington: Conceivability and Modal Knowledge ............................................. 317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Joseph L. Camp, Jr.: The Ballad of Clyde the Moose ................................................................. 327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contributors .................................................................................................................................... 335</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>